MDL DOCKET No. 14-md-02521-WHO

Disclosure and discovery activity in the actions consolidated for pretrial purposes under this Master File are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation would be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled under the applicable legal principles to treatment as confidential. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 7, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order creates no entitlement to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and reflects the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the Court to file material under seal.

1. SCOPE OF PROTECTIVE ORDER

1.1 This Protective Order shall apply to all documents, things, or information subject to discovery in these actions that is owned, possessed, or controlled by a party or a non-party and that contains the party's or non-party's trade secrets or other confidential research, development or commercial information in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c)(1), or other information required by law or agreement to be kept confidential ("Confidential Discovery Material"). Notwithstanding the scope of this Protective Order, the parties recognize that use of Confidential Discovery Material at trial is an issue to be discussed in advance of and addressed as appropriate in the proposed Joint Pretrial Order.

2. CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS (TWO-TIER)

2.1 Each party and any non-party shall have the right to designate any Confidential Discovery Material as confidential and subject to this Protective Order, by marking such Material as either "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL." It shall be the duty of the party or non-party who seeks to invoke protection under this Protective Order ("Producing Party") to give notice, as set forth below, of the Confidential Discovery Material designated to be covered by this protective Order ("Designated [CONFIDENTIAL]

Material"). The duty of the parties and of all other persons bound by this Protective Order to maintain the confidentiality of Confidential Discovery Material so designated ("Receiving Party") shall commence with such notice.

- 2.2 Under this Protective Order, Confidential Discovery Material shall be marked "CONFIDENTIAL" if, and only if, the Producing Party in good faith considers the Discovery Material to be, reflect or reveal a trade secret or other confidential research, development or commercial information in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c)(1), or other information required by law or agreement to be kept confidential.
- 2.3 Under this Protective Order, Confidential Discovery Materials can be designated as "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" Material if the Confidential Discovery Material is "CONFIDENTIAL" as set forth in Paragraph 2.2 above and constitutes or reflects trade secrets or other proprietary information; confidential research, development, testing and studies relating to drug products; and/or sensitive financial or strategic commercial information, where the disclosure of the information is likely to cause harm to the competitive position of the Producing Party.
- 2.4 CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material, respectively, shall include: (a) all copies, extracts, and complete or partial summaries prepared from such CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material; (b) portions of deposition transcripts and exhibits thereto that contain, summarize, or reflect the content of any such CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material; (c) portions of briefs, memoranda, or any other writings filed with the Court and exhibits thereto that contain, summarize, or reflect the content of any such CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material; (d) written discovery responses and answers that contain, summarize, or reflect the content of any such CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material; and (e) deposition testimony designated in accordance with the paragraphs below.
- 2.5 CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material shall not include any discovery material which:

1	a. is in the public domain at the time of disclosure;
2	b. becomes part of the public domain through no fault of a Receiving Party or
3	third parties who are not in breach of any obligations to the Producing
4	Party;
5	c. is information the Receiving Party can show was in its possession prior to
6	the time of disclosure; or
7	d. is information the Receiving Party receives at a later date from a third party
8	properly and rightfully in possession of said information, and not as a result
9	of any breach of confidentiality, and properly and rightfully authorized to
10	make disclosure without restriction as to disclosure.
11	3. DESIGNATING MATERIALS AS "CONFIDENTIAL" AND/OR "HIGHLY
12	CONFIDENTIAL"
13	3.1 The designation of information as CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY
14	CONFIDENTIAL Material for purposes of this Order shall be made in the following manner:
15	a. with regard to written material (including transcripts of depositions or other
16	testimony), a legend shall be affixed to each page substantially in the form,
17	"CONFIDENTIAL — Subject to Protective Order" or "HIGHLY
18	CONFIDENTIAL — Subject to Protective Order"; and
19	b. with regard to non-written material, such as recordings, magnetic media,
20	photographs and things, a legend substantially in the above form shall be
21	affixed to the material, or a container for it, in any suitable manner.
22	c. A Party or non-party that makes original documents or materials available
23	for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the
24	inspecting Party has indicated which material it would like copied and
25	produced. During the inspection and before the designation, and until and
26	unless produced without any confidentiality designation, all of the material
27	made available for inspection shall be deemed to be HIGHLY
28	

CONFIDENTIAL Material. After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party shall affix the appropriate legend on each page that contains Confidential Discovery Material.

d. Any party may designate any or all portions of depositions taken in these actions as CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material either (1) by making a statement on the record at the deposition, or (2) by serving notice in writing to counsel of record within thirty (30) days of receiving the transcript of the deposition. Only those portions of a deposition that actually contain CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material may be so designated. All deposition transcripts will be treated as HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material until a party designates any or all portions of the transcript as CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material or until thirty (30) days after receipt of the transcript, whichever is earlier. If a designation is made, the CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL portions and exhibits, if filed with the Court, shall be subject to the filing requirements set forth in Paragraph 7 below. If any depositions are videotaped or digitally recorded, those portions of the videotape or recording corresponding to portions of the deposition transcript designated as CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL shall be afforded the same status.

3.2 Notwithstanding the obligation to timely designate CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material under the foregoing paragraphs 3.1(a)-(d), the inadvertent or unintentional failure to designate specific Confidential Discovery Material as CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material shall not be deemed a waiver in whole or in part of the claim of confidentiality. Upon prompt notice from the Producing Party of

1	such failure to designate, all Receiving Partie
2	inadvertently or unintentionally disclosed Con
3	held in breach of this Order if, prior to notific
4	Discovery Material had been disclosed or use
5	designation. The Producing Party shall provide
6	bearing the corrected designation. The Recei
7	the undesignated Confidential Discovery Mat
8	4. DISCLOSURE AND USE OF CON
9	4.1 Absent an agreement of the Pr
10	Court or other court of competent jurisdiction
11	each party and all other persons bound by the
12	designated as CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGH
13	party other than itself solely for purposes of the
14	any other purpose, including, without limitation
15	attorneys of record for the parties shall exerci
16	documents governed by this Protective Order
17	and (b) disclosed only to authorized persons.
18	4.2 Subject to Paragraphs 4.4-5.4,
19	summarized, described, revealed or otherwise
20	accordance with the terms of this Order and o
21	a. any employee of a Part
22	assistance in the condu
23	executes a copy of the
24	Producing Party object

s shall cooperate to restore the confidentiality of the nfidential Discovery Material. No party shall be eation of such later -designation, such Confidential d in a manner inconsistent with such later de substitute copies of the Discovery Material ving Party shall return or certify the destruction of erial.

FIDENTIAL DISCOVERY MATERIAL

- oducing Party or an Order to the contrary by this , and except as provided in Paragraph 4.4 below, terms of this Protective Order shall use any material HLY CONFIDENTIAL Material by a party or nonhese actions, and such Material shall not be used for on, any business or commercial purpose. The se reasonable care to ensure that the information and are (a) used only for the purpose specified herein,
- CONFIDENTIAL Material may be disclosed, e made available in whole or in part only in only to the following persons:
 - y who is required in good faith to provide material ct of the litigation of these actions, and who Undertaking attached hereto as Exhibit A. If a Producing Party objects to the disclosure of CONFIDENTIAL material to any such employee, the designated employee may not view that producing party's CONFIDENTIAL Material, provided that the designating party

27

25

26

28		6
27		photocopying; videotaping; translating; preparing exhibits or
26	h.	persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g.,
25		Undertaking attached as Exhibit A;
24		conduct of these actions, so long as such person has executed a copy of the
23		and trial consultants) and their staff retained to assist the parties in the
22	g.	outside experts and consultants in any other field (e.g., economic experts
21		Undertaking attached as Exhibit A;
20		of Paragraph 5.2 and so long as such person has executed a copy of the
19		assist the parties in the conduct of these actions, subject to the provisions
18		and/or approval of pharmaceutical products and their staff retained to
17	f.	outside experts and consultants in the fields of marketing, development,
16		deem proper;
15	e.	any person designated by the Court upon such terms as the Court may
14		appeal in these actions;
13		or transcribing testimony or argument at any deposition, hearing, trial or
12		qualified persons (including necessary clerical personnel) recording, taking
11		actions, any appellate court(s), court personnel, jurors, alternate jurors, and
10	d.	this Court, or any other court exercising jurisdiction with respect to these
9		these actions on behalf of named Parties;
8		technical, administrative and other support staff, engaged in the conduct of
7		entered an appearance in these actions, their respective legal, investigative,
6	c.	outside counsel for the Parties in these actions or other counsel who have
5		actions;
4		administrative and other support staff, engaged in the conduct of these
3	b.	Parties' internal counsel, and their legal, investigative, technical,
2	_	effort with the Producing Party to resolve the objection.
1		may seek relief from the Court following a good faith meet and confer
.		

1		demonstrations; organizing, storing, retrieving data in any form or medium;
2		etc.) and their employees and subcontractors, including any assistants
3		and/or mock jurors that professional jury or trial consultants may employ,
4		retained by outside counsel for a Party to whom it is reasonably necessary
5		to disclose the information for these actions and who will maintain the
6		confidentiality of such Confidential Discovery Material;
7	i.	witnesses or potential witnesses in these actions and their counsel, as
8		permitted pursuant to the provisions of Paragraphs 6.1-6.3;
9	j.	court reporters, videographers and translators; and
10	k.	others as to whom the Producing Party has given written consent.
11	4.3 Subj	ect to Paragraphs 4.4-5.4, HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material may be
12	disclosed, summariz	zed, described, revealed or otherwise made available in whole or in part only
13	in accordance with	the terms of this Order, and only to the following persons:
14	a.	Parties' internal counsel, and their legal, investigative, technical,
15		administrative and other support staff, engaged in the conduct of these
16		actions;
17	b.	outside counsel for the Parties in these actions or other outside counsel who
18		have entered an appearance in these actions and regular and temporary staff
19		of such counsel to the extent necessary to assist such counsel in the conduct
20		of these actions;
21	c.	outside experts and consultants in the fields of marketing, development,
22		and/or approval of pharmaceutical products and their staff retained to
23		assist the parties in the conduct of these actions, subject to the provisions
24		of Paragraph 5.2 and so long as such person has executed a copy of the
25		Undertaking attached as Exhibit A;
26	d.	outside experts and consultants in any other field (e.g., economic experts
27		and trial consultants) and their staff retained to assist the parties in the
28		
		7

1	conduct of these actions, so long as such person has executed a copy of the			
2	Undertaking attached as Exhibit A;			
3	e. persons or entities that provide litigation support services ($e.g.$,			
4	photocopying; videotaping; translating; preparing exhibits or			
5	demonstrations; organizing, storing, retrieving data in any form or medium;			
6	etc.) and their employees and subcontractors, including any assistants			
7	and/or mock jurors that professional jury or trial consultants may employ,			
8	retained by outside counsel for a Party to whom it is reasonably necessary			
9	to disclose the information for these actions and who will maintain the			
10	confidentiality of such Confidential Discovery Material;			
11	f. witnesses or potential witnesses in these actions and their counsel, as			
12	permitted pursuant to the provisions of Paragraphs 6.1-6.3;			
13	g. the Court and its employees and the jury;			
14	h. court reporters, videographers and translators; and			
15	i. others as to whom the Producing Party has given written consent.			
16	The parties anticipate that there may be a need for additional confidentiality protection for a			
17	limited number of HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL materials that contain highly sensitive, forward-			
18	looking business information. Such material may be designated as "OUTSIDE COUNSEL EYES			
19	ONLY," and may not be shown to parties' internal counsel notwithstanding Paragraph 4.3.a.			
20	above, but may be shown to all remaining parties identified in Paragraph 4.3 subject to the terms			
21	and conditions herein.			
22	4.4 Irrespective of whether an individual has executed the CONFIDENTIAL or			
23	HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Undertaking, this Order shall not apply to and, thus, does not restrict			
24	any party's use, for any purpose, of (1) its own CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY			
25	CONFIDENTIAL Material, or (2) any documents, things, information or other material that, at			
26	the time of disclosure in these actions, is publicly known through no unauthorized act of such			
27	party or was lawfully developed or obtained independent of discovery in these actions.			
28				

Moreover, this Order shall not apply to and does not restrict any individual from reviewing or seeing any document generated or received by that individual or communicated to or known to that individual, and does not restrict any individual from reviewing or seeing any document containing information believed in good faith to be known to the individual. Notwithstanding the foregoing, any portions of the CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material that, on its face, was not communicated to or known to the individual shall be redacted before showing the document to the individual. Nothing in this Paragraph is intended to, or does, preclude a Party from taking action under Paragraph 10.3 below due to the conduct described in this Paragraph.

- 4.5 This Order shall not restrict any attorney who is a qualified recipient under the terms of Paragraphs 4.2(b)-(c) and 4.3(a) from rendering advice to his or her client that is a Party with respect to these actions, and in the course thereof, from generally relying upon his or her examination of CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material. In rendering such advice or in otherwise communicating with the client, the attorney shall not disclose directly or indirectly the specific content of any CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material of another Party or non-party where such disclosure would not otherwise be permitted under the terms of this Order.
- 4.6 If a party is served with a subpoena, discovery request in another action, or any other request seeking by legal process the production of documents, things, information or other material produced to it and designated as CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material in these actions, such party shall notify promptly the Producing Party so as to provide the Producing Party a reasonable opportunity to object to the production.

5. PROCEDURES FOR DISCLOSURE OF "CONFIDENTIAL" AND "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" INFORMATION

5.1 Every person to whom CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material or information contained therein is to be disclosed, summarized, described, characterized, or otherwise communicated or made available in whole or in part, first shall be

12

16

17

20

22 23

24

25

26 27

28

advised that the material or information is being disclosed pursuant and subject to the terms of this Order.

- 5.2 Furthermore, regarding those qualified recipients under the terms of Paragraphs 4.2(f) and 4.3(c)to whom disclosure of CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material is sought, the Party seeking to disclose such Material shall give notice to the Producing Party as follows: Counsel for the Party seeking to make the disclosure shall provide written notice by electronic mail to counsel for the Producing Party, and all other Parties to these actions, that (1) sets forth the full name of the expert and the city and state of his or her primary residence, (2) attaches a copy of the expert's current resume, (3) identifies the expert's current employer(s), (4) identifies (by name and number of the case and location of court) any litigation in connection with which the individual has testified as an expert during the preceding four years, and (5) attaches an executed copy of the Undertaking attached hereto as Exhibit A. Counsel for the Party seeking to disclose such Material need not specifically identify the Designated CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material intended to be disclosed.
- 5.3 The Producing Party shall have seven (7) days after receiving notification pursuant to Paragraphs 5.2 within which to object to the proposed disclosure, as provided below; such disclosure shall not occur before the time for any objection by the Producing Party expires, and, if any such objection is made, before that objection is resolved, as provided below. Any such objection shall be made in writing by electronic mail to the counsel for the Party seeking to make the disclosure, and all other Parties to these actions. Failure to object within the time period set forth above shall be deemed consent.
- 5.4 Within seven (7) days of receipt of an objection, the Parties shall meet and confer to attempt to resolve their dispute. If the objection cannot be resolved by the Parties, the Party making the objection has ten (10) days to seek relief from the Court. If the Party making the objection seeks such relief from the Court, the intended disclosure shall not be made unless and until the Court enters an order authorizing such disclosure. The Party making the objection shall have the burden of proof that the intended disclosure should not occur. To discourage

1	unwarranted objections and motions practice, a moving party whose objection is overruled shall
2	pay expenses, including reasonable attorney fees, to the Party seeking to disclose the Material.
3	6. EXAMINATION OF WITNESSES
4	6.1 Any inventor or current employee of a Party may be examined at trial or upon
5	deposition concerning any CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material of
6	such Party.
7	6.2 Any expert witness may be examined at trial or upon deposition concerning any
8	CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material.
9	6.3 Any other person may be examined as a witness at trial or upon deposition
10	concerning any CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material which that person
11	had lawfully generated, received or which was previously communicated to or known to that
12	witness. During examination or preparation therefor, any such witness may be shown
13	CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material which appears on its face or from
14	other documents or testimony to have been generated or received by that witness or
15	communicated to or known to that witness or which contains information believed in good faith
16	to be known to the individual. Any portions of the CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY
17	CONFIDENTIAL Material that, on its face, was not communicated to or known to the witness
18	shall be redacted before showing the document to the witness.
19	7. FILING PROTECTED MATERIAL
20	Without written permission from the Producing Party or a Court order secured after
21	appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this action
22	any Confidential Discovery Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Confidential
23	Discovery Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5.
24	8. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED MATERIAL
25	8.1 If information subject to a claim of attorney-client privilege, work product
26	immunity, or any other applicable privilege or immunity is produced inadvertently, the Parties

28

27

shall comply with Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(5)(B).

9. OBLIGATIONS OF OUTSIDE COUNSEL

9.1 It shall be the responsibility of outside counsel to ensure strict compliance with the provisions of this Protective Order in their dealings with CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material, and it shall be the responsibility of outside counsel to take reasonable and proper steps to ensure that this Protective Order and all provisions thereof are made known to any person who shall examine CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material as provided herein. All persons responsible for determining that materials contain CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material shall be familiar with this Protective Order and the scope of its protection. All CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material including any and all copies thereof shall be kept by the Receiving Party in a place appropriately safe, given its status.

10. OTHER

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

10.1 Conclusion of the Action: Within sixty (60) days after entry of a final judgment or dismissal with prejudice in these actions (including appeals or petitions for review) or the execution of a settlement agreement among all the parties finally disposing of all issues raised in these actions, outside counsel and all other persons having possession or control of another party's CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material, including any briefs, motions, pleadings, expert reports or other documents created during the course of these actions that contain CONFIDENTIAL and/or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material, shall: (a) return all CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material and any copies thereof to the appropriate outside counsel who produced the CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material; or (b) destroy such CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material. Each party shall give written notice of such destruction to outside counsel for the Producing Party. Counsel of record, however, may retain copies of all filings, written discovery, and correspondence for archival purposes. Further, all notes, summaries, or other documents prepared by attorneys, or outside experts/consultants designated as provided in Paragraphs 10and 11, derived from or containing CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY

3

1

4 5

6

7 8

9

10 11

12

13 14

16

15

18

17

19 20

21 22

23

24

26

25

27

28

CONFIDENTIAL Material, shall after the conclusion of the actions, be kept within the files of trial counsel for the party creating such work product, or be destroyed.

10.2 Other Proceedings: By entering this order and limiting the disclosure of information in this case, the Court does not intend to preclude another court from finding that information may be relevant and subject to disclosure in another case. Any person or party subject to this order who becomes subject to a motion to disclose another party's information Designated CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material pursuant to this order shall promptly notify the Producing Party of the motion so that the party may have an opportunity to appear and be heard on whether that information should be disclosed.

10.3 Contested Designations: A Party shall not be obligated to challenge the propriety of designating any CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material at the time such designation is made, and failure to do so shall not preclude a subsequent challenge thereto. In the event that a Party disagrees at any stage of these proceedings with the designation by the Producing Party of any information as CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material, the Parties shall try first to resolve such dispute in good faith on an informal basis. The objecting Party shall first provide written notice to the Producing Party, identifying the CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Discovery Material whose designation it challenges and setting forth the basis for the challenge. Except in the case of a challenge for more than twenty (20) documents or more than twenty-five (25) pages of deposition testimony, within fourteen (14) days of its receipt of written notice of the challenge to its designation, the Producing Party shall meet and confer with the objecting Party in order to attempt to resolve any dispute concerning the designation by agreement or stipulation. In the case of a challenge for more than twenty (20) documents or more than twenty-five (25) pages of deposition testimony, the challenging Party and the Producing Party shall meet and confer in good faith to establish a reasonable timeframe for a response to the challenge. If the dispute cannot be resolved, the objecting Party may seek appropriate relief from the Court, but the Party seeking to restrict disclosure of information shall bear the burden of proof that it constitutes CONFIDENTIAL and

1	HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material. The objecting Party's motion or application to the Court
2	shall identify with specificity the CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Discovery
3	Material that is the subject of the motion, but shall not disclose or reveal the contents of that
4	material except in the manner prescribed by Paragraph 7 of this Protective Order. If such a motion
5	or application is made, all Discovery Material so designated shall maintain CONFIDENTIAL or
6	HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL status pending a determination by the court as to its appropriate
7	status.
8	10.4 <u>Non-waiver</u> : The production of Confidential Discovery Materials by a Party under
9	the terms of this Order shall not be construed to mean that the Producing Party has waived any
10	objection to the production, relevancy or admissibility of such Materials. Nothing contained
11	herein shall preclude any Party from opposing any discovery on any basis.
12	10.5 <u>Additional Parties</u> : If an additional party joins or is joined in these actions, the
13	newly joined party shall not have access to CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL
14	Material until the parties agree to a supplemental Protective Order governing the protection of
15	CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material.
16	10.6 <u>Third Parties</u> : Third Parties shall be treated as Parties for purposes of this
17	Protective Order, except to the extent ordered otherwise by this Court or another court of
18	coordinate jurisdiction. Any Third Party from whom discovery is sought in these actions may
19	designate some or all of the documents, things, information or other material as
20	CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material under this Protective Order. If it
21	does so, then each Party to the action will have with respect to such CONFIDENTIAL and
22	HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material the same obligations which that Party has with respect to
23	CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material of another Party to the action.
24	Nothing in this Paragraph or this Protective Order is intended to, or does, excuse any Third Party
25	from compliance with a duly served subpoena.
26	10.7 <u>Attendance at Depositions</u> : If a deposition concerns CONFIDENTIAL or
27	HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material, the Producing Party shall have the right to exclude from
- 1	

the portion of the deposition concerning such information any person not authorized in accordance with Paragraphs 4.2-4.3 above to have access to such Material. In-house counsel authorized to receive CONFIDENTIAL Material pursuant to Paragraph 10(b) shall only be excluded from the portion of the deposition that contains questions and answers that reveal the content of information designated HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL, the disclosure of which is likely to cause harm to the competitive position of the Producing Party, and which would have been redacted from expert reports, pleadings, briefs or other papers filed with the Court in these actions under seal as specified in Paragraph 7.

10.8 <u>Unauthorized Disclosure</u>: In the event of disclosure of any CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material to a person not authorized to have access to such material, the Party responsible for having made, and any Party with knowledge of, such disclosure shall immediately inform outside counsel for the Producing Party whose CONFIDENTIAL or HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material has thus been disclosed of all known relevant information concerning the nature and circumstances of the disclosure. The responsible Party also promptly shall take all reasonable measures to ensure that no further or greater unauthorized disclosure or use of such Material is made and to retrieve any Material improperly disclosed. Each Party shall cooperate in good faith in that effort.

10.9 Termination of Access:

- a. In the event any person or Party ceases to be engaged in the conduct of these actions, such person's or Party's access to CONFIDENTIAL and HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL Material shall be terminated, and all copies thereof shall be returned or destroyed in accordance with the terms of Paragraph 10.1 hereof, except that such return or destruction shall take place as soon as practicable after such person or party ceases to be engaged in the conduct of these actions.
- b. The provisions of this Order shall remain in full force and effect as to any person or Party who previously had access to CONFIDENTIAL and

	II .	
1	HIGHLY CONFIDENTIA	AL Material, except as may be specifically
2	ordered by the Court or co	onsented to by the Producing Party.
3	B 10.10 Modification:	
4	a. Stipulations may be made	, between Counsel for the respective Parties, as to
5	the application of this Ord	ler to specific situations, provided that such
6	stipulations are recorded i	n writing or contained in the record of any oral
7	proceeding. Nothing cont	ained herein shall preclude any Party from
8	seeking an order of the Co	ourt modifying or supplementing this Order.
9		tion of these actions, the confidentiality
10		•
11		
12		
13	SO STIPULATED.	
14		
15	Dated: May 7, 2014	
	Respectfully submitted by:	
16		/s/ Daniel C. Girard
17	Peter R. Kohn	Daniel C. Girard (SBN 114826)
18		Dena C. Sharp (SBN 245869)
19	FARUQI & FARUQI LLP 101 Greenwood Avenue	GIRARD GIBBS LLP 601 California Street, 14th Floor
20	Suite 600	San Francisco, CA 94108
	Jenkintown, PA 19046	Telephone: (415) 981-4800 Facsimile: (415) 981-4846
21	Facsimile: (215) 277-5770	Email: dcg@girardgibbs.com
22		Email: chc@girardgibbs.com
23	Elic L. Clamer	Attorneys for Plaintiffs United Food and
24	David F. Sorensen BERGER & MONTAGUE, P.C.	Commercial Workers Local 1776 & Participating Employers Health and Welfare Fund and
25	1622 Locust Street	Fraternal Order of Police, Fort Lauderdale
26	Philadelphia, PA 19103 Telephone: (215) 875-3000	Lodge 31, Insurance Trust Fund
27	Facsimile: (215) 875-4604	
28		

1	Barry S. Taus	Steve D. Shadowen
2	Archana Tamoshunas TAUS, CEBULASH & LANDAU, LLP	HILLIARD & SHADOWEN LLP 39 West Main Street
3	80 Maiden Lane, Suite 1204	Mechanicsburg, PA 17055
3	New York, NY 10038	Telephone: (855) 344-3298
4	Telephone: (212) 931-0704	Email: steve@hilliardshadowenlaw.com
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff Rochester Drug Co-	Natalie Finkelman Bennett
6	Operative, Inc.	James C. Shah Eric L. Young
7	/s/ Thomas M. Sobol	SHEPHERD, FINKELMAN, MILLER &
	Thomas M. Sobol	SHAH, LLP
8	David S. Nalven	35 E. State Street
9	Ed Notargiacomo	Media, PA 19063
7	HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO	Telephone: (610) 891-9880
10	LLP 55 Cambridge Parkway, Suite 301	Facsimile: (610) 891-9883 Email: nfinkelman@sfmslaw.com
11	Cambridge, MA 02142	Email. minkeman@smistaw.com
11	Telephone: (617) 482-3700	Attorneys for Plaintiff United Food and
12	Email: tom@hbsslaw.com	Commercial Workers Local 1776 & Participating
13	Email: davidn@hbsslaw.com Email: ed@hbsslaw.com	Employers Health and Welfare Fund
1.4		/s/ Jayne A. Goldstein
14	Jeff D. Friedman (SBN 173886)	Jayne A. Goldstein
15	HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO	POMERANTZ LLP
	LLP	1792 Bell Tower Lane, Suite 203
16	715 Hearst Avenue, Suite 202	Weston, FL 33326
17	Berkeley, CA 94710	Telephone: (954) 315-3454
1/	Telephone: (510) 725-3000	Facsimile: (954) 315-3455
18	Facsimile: (510) 725-3001 jefff@hbsslaw.com	Email: jagoldstein@pomlaw.com
19	Jenne nossiaw.com	Attorneys for Plaintiff Fraternal Order of Police,
19	John Radice	Fort Lauderdale Lodge 31, Insurance Trust Fund
20	RADICE LAW FIRM	
	34 Sunset Blvd	/s/ Renae D. Steiner
21	Long Beach, NJ 08008	Renae D. Steiner
22	Telephone: (646) 386-7688	HEINS MILLS & OLSON, P.L.C.
	Email: jradice@radicelawfirm.com	310 Clifton Avenue
23		Minneapolis, MN 55403
	Attorneys for Plaintiff American Sales	Telephone: (612) 338-4605
24	Company, LLC	Facsimile: (612) 338-4692
25	//B	Email: rsteiner@heinsmills.com
23	/s/ Bruce E. Gerstein	
26	Bruce E. Gerstein	Attorneys for Plaintiff Greater Metropolitan
<u>, </u>	Joseph Opper Enhance B. Constain	Hotel Employers-Employees Health and Welfare Fund
27	Ephraim R. Gerstein GARWIN GERSTEIN & FISHER LLP	r una
28	GARWIN GEROTEIN & FISHER LLF	

I		
1	88 Pine Street, 10 th Floor	/s/ Lee Albert
	New York, NY 10005	Lee Albert
2	Telephone: (212) 398-0055	GLANCY BINKOW & GOLDBERG LLP
3	Facsimile: (212) 764-6620	122 East 42nd Street, Suite 2920
	Email: bgerstein@garwingerstein.com	New York, NY 10168
4	Email: jopper@garwingerstein.com	Telephone: (212) 682-5340
5	Email: egerstein@garwingerstein.com	Facsimile: (212) 884-0988
5	Street E. Des Boshes	Email: lalbert@glancylaw.com
6	Stuart E. Des Roches ODOM & DES ROCHES LLP	Attorneys for Plumbers & Pipefitters Local 178
_	650 Poydras Street, Suite 2020	Health & Welfare Trust Fund
7	New Orleans, LA 70130	Treath & Weighte Trust I that
8	Telephone: (504) 522-0077	/s/ Joseph R. Saveri
	Facsimile: (504) 522-0078	Joseph R. Saveri
9	Email: stuart@odrlaw.com	Ryan J. McEwan
10		JOSEPH SAVERI LAW FIRM, INC.
10		505 Montgomery Street, Suite 625
11	David C. Raphael, Jr.	San Francisco, California 94111
	SMITH SEGURA & RAPHAEL LLP	Telephone: (415) 500-6800
12	3600 Jackson Street, Suite 111	Facsimile: (415) 395-9940
13	Alexandria, LA 71303	Email: jsaveri@saverilawfirm.com
15	Telephone: (318) 445-4480	Email: rmcewan@saverilawfirm.com
14	Facsimile: (318) 487-1741	Account Complete CCC I and 177 Harris I've
	Email: draphael@ssrllp.com Russ Chorush	Attorneys for Plaintiffs Local 17 Hospitality
15	HEIM PAYNE & CHORUSH LLP	Benefit Fund and Steven Roller
16	600 Travis, Suite 6710	/s/ Jacob A. Goldberg
	Houston, TX 77002	Jacob A. Goldberg
17	Telephone: (713) 221-2000	COHEN PLACITELLA & ROTH, P.C.
18	Facsimile: (713) 221-2021	Two Commerce Square, Suite 2900
10	Email: rchorush@hpcllp.com	2001 Market Street
19		Philadelphia, P A 19103
	Attorneys for Plaintiff Drogueria Betances,	Telephone: (215) 567-3500
20	Inc.	Email: jgoldberg@cprlaw.com
21	/-/ I '- I D M I	/ / NT
	/ <u>s/ Linda P. Nussbaum</u> Linda P. Nussbaum	<u>/s/ Noah Axler</u> Noah Axler
22	Bradley J. Demuth	DONOVAN AXLER, LLC
23	Adam Steinfeld	1845 Walnut Street, Suite 1100
23	GRANT & EISENHOFER P.A.	Philadelphia, PA 19103
24	485 Lexington Avenue, 29 th Floor	Telephone: (215) 732-6067
	New York, NY 10017	Email: naxler@donovanaxler.com
25	Telephone: (646) 722-8500	
26	Facsimile: (646) 722-8501	Attorneys for Philadelphia Federation of
20	Email: lnussbaum@gelaw.com	Teachers Health & Welfare Fund
27	Email: bdemuth@gelaw.com	
20	Email: asteinfeld@gelaw.com	
28		
		18

1	Juan R. Rivera Font	/s/ George E. Barrett
	JUAN R. RIVERA FONT LLC	George E. Barrett
2	Ave. Gonzales Giusti #27, Suite 602	Jerry E. Martin
3	Guaynabo, PR 00968	BARRETT JOHNSTON LLC
	Telephone: (787) 751-5290	217 Second Avenue North
4	Facsimile: (787) 751-6155	Nashville, TN 37201
		Telephone: (615) 244-2202
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff Cesar Castillo, Inc.	Facsimile: (615) 252-3798
6		Email: gbarrett@barrettjohnston.com
6	For the Defendants:	Email: jmartin@barrettjohnston.com
7		
	SQUIRE SANDERS (US) LLP	Attorneys for Plaintiff Pirelli Armstrong Retiree
8		Medical Benefits Trust
9	/s/ David S. Elkins	//I.D. I. D. I. I
9	David S. Elkins (State Bar No. 148077)	/s/ J. Douglas Richards
10	600 Hansen Way	J. Douglas Richards
	Palo Alto, California 94304	Sharon K. Robertson
11	Telephone: (650) 856-6500	COHEN MILSTEIN SELLERS & TOLL
12	Facsimile: (650) 843-8777	PLLC
12	David.Elkins@squiresanders.com	88 Pine Street, 14th Floor
13	Nother Leng III (State Per No. 50061)	New York, New York 10005
	Nathan Lane III (State Bar No. 50961)	Telephone: (212) 758-3042
14	Noriyuki Shimoda (State Bar No. 176973) Joseph A. Meckes (State Bar No. 190279)	Facsimile: (212) 838-7745
	275 Battery Street, 26th Floor	Attorneys for Plaintiff Welfare Plan of the
15	San Francisco, California 94111	International Union of Operation Engineers
16	Telephone: (415) 954-0200	Locals 137, 137A, 137B, 137C, 137R
10	Facsimile: (415) 393-9887	Locuis 137, 13711, 137D, 137C, 137K
17	Nathan.Lane@squiresanders.com	/s/ Michael M. Buchman
	Noriyuki.Shimoda@squiresanders.com	Michael M. Buchman
18	Joseph.Meckes@squiresanders.com	John A. Ioannou
19		MOTLEY RICE LLC
1	Attorneys for Defendants Teikoku Pharma	600 Third Ave, Suite 2101
20	USA, Inc. and Teikoku Seiyaku Co., LTD.	New York, New York 10016
		Telephone: (212) 577-0051
21	ARNOLD & PORTER LLP	Facsimile: (212) 577-0054
22		Email: mbuchman@motleyrice.com
	/s/ Diane E. Bieri	Email: jioannou@motleyrice.com
23	Diane E. Bieri	
	Jonathan L. Stern (admitted pro hac vice)	Attorneys for Plaintiff City of Providence, Rhode
24	Diane E. Bieri (admitted pro hac vice)	Island
ے ا	Ryan Z. Watts (admitted pro hac vice)	
25	555 Twelfth Street, N.W.	/s/ Marvin A. Miller
26	Washington, D.C. 20004-1206	Marvin A. Miller
_	Telephone: (202) 942-5000	Lori A. Fanning
27	Facsimile: (202) 942-4999	MILLER LAW LLC
_	Jonathan.Stern@aporter.com	115 South LaSalle Street, Suite 2910
28		

- 1		
1	Diane.Bieri@aporter.com	Chicago, IL 60603
$_{2}$	Ryan.Watts@aporter.com	Telephone: (312) 332-3400
_	David D. Adina and (Chata Dav No. 165661)	Email: mmiller@millerlawllc.com
3	Daniel B. Asimow (State Bar No. 165661) 10th Floor	Email: lfanning@millerlawllc.com
4	Three Embarcadero Center	Attorneys for Plaintiff Painters District Council
'	San Francisco, California 94111-4024	No. 30 Health & Welfare Fund
5	Telephone: (415) 471-3100	v
	Facsimile: (415) 471-3400	/s/ David W. Mitchell
6	Daniel.Asimow@aporter.com	David W. Mitchell
7		Brian O. O'Mara
	Attorneys for Defendant Endo	Lonnie A. Browne
8	Pharmaceuticals Inc.	ROBBINS GELLER RUDMAN & DOWD LLP
9	SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE, MEAGHER	655 West Broadway, Suite 1900
.	& FLOM	San Diego, CA 92101
10		Telephone: (619) 231-1058
11	/s/ Steven C. Sunshine	Facsimile: (619) 231-7423
11	Steven C. Sunshine	
12	James Schaefer (State Bar No. 250417)	Attorneys for Plaintiff NECA-IBEW Welfare
,	525 University Avenue	Trust Fund
13	Palo Alto, California 94301-1908	
14	Telephone: (650) 470-4500	/s/ Jeffrey L. Kodroff
	Facsimile: (650) 470-4570	Jeffrey L. Kodroff
15	James.Schaefer@skadden.com	SPECTOR ROSEMAN KODROFF & WILLIS, P.C.
16	Steven C. Sunshine (admitted pro hac vice)	1818 Market Street, Suite 2500
	1440 New York Avenue, N.W.	Philadelphia, PA 19103
17	Washington, D.C. 20005-2111	Telephone: (215) 496-0300
18	Telephone: (202) 371-7000	Facsimile: (215) 496-6611
	Facsimile: (202) 393-5760	Email: jkodroff@srkw-law.com
19	Karen Hoffman Lent (admitted pro hac vice)	Attorneys for Plaintiffs Greater Metropolitan
20	Four Times Square	Hotel Employers-Employees Health and Welfare
	New York, New York 10036	Fund and Twin City Iron Workers Health and
21	Telephone: (212) 735-3000	Welfare Fund
22	Facsimile: (917) 777-3000	
		<u>/s/ James R. Dugan, II</u>
23	Attorneys for Defendants	James R. Dugan, II
,	Actavis, Inc., Watson Pharmaceuticals, Inc.,	THE DUGAN LAW FIRM, APLC
24	Watson Laboratories, Inc., Actavis plc., Anda	365 Canal Street, Suite 1000
25	Inc., Anda Pharmaceuticals, Inc., and Valmed Pharmaceuticals, Inc.	New Orleans, Louisiana 70130 Telephone: (504) 648-0180
	vaimea i narmaceuticus, inc.	Facsimile: (504) 648-0181
26		Email: jdugan@dugan-lawfirm.com
27		
		Attorneys for Plaintiff Allied Services Division
28		
		20

	Case 3:14-cv-01891-WHO	Document 28	Filed 05/08/14	Page 22 of 24	
1	Welfare Fund				
2			/s/ Robert W. Sink		
3			Robert W. Sink LAW OFFICES OF ROBERT W. SINK		
4			1800 J.F.K. Blvd., 14th Floor		
5			Philadelphia, PA 19103 Tel: (215) 995-1000		
6			, ,		
			Joseph C. Kohn William E. Hoese		
7			KOHN, SWIFT		
8				Street, Suite 2100	
			Philadelphia, PA	19106	
9			Tel: (215) 238-17	700	
10			Attorney for Plai	ntiff Irene Kampanis	
11			/s/ Robert S. Kito	henoff	
12			Robert S. Kitche	noff	
10				ITCHENOFF & ASHER LLC	
13			1845 Walnut Str		
14			Philadelphia, PA		
			Telephone: (215)		
15			Email: Kitchenot	T@wka-law.com	
16			/s/ Stephen E. Co		
17			Stephen E. Conn	=	
1,			2200 Renaissanc	ELLS & GRAY, LLP	
18			King of Prussia,		
10			Telephone: (610)		
19			Email: sconnolly		
20			,	2	
21			• •	ımsters Union Local 115 Health	
			& Welfare Fund		
22			/s/ Krishna B. Na	ırin <u>e</u>	
23			Krishna B. Narin	e	
_			MEREDITH &		
24			100 Broad Street		
25			Philadelphia, PA		
23			Telephone: (215)		
26			Eman, knarmew	m-npartners.com	
27					
28					
		,	21		
		<u> </u>			

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER MDL DOCKET NO. 14-md-02521-WHO

Case 3:14-cv-01891-WHO Document 28 Filed 05/08/14 Page 23 of 24

1	EXHIBIT A				
2	UNDERTAKING TO BE BOUND BY STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER				
3	I,[print or type full name], of				
4	[print or type full address], declare under penalty of				
5	perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order issued by				
6	the United States District Court for the Northern District of California on May, 2014 in the				
7	action In re Lidoderm Antitrust Litigation, MDL Docket No. 14-md-02521-WHO.				
8	I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of the Stipulated Protective Order				
9	I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and				
10	punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner				
11	any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity				
12	except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.				
13	I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the				
14	Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of the Stipulated Protective				
15	Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.				
16	I hereby appoint [print or type full name] of				
17	[print/type full address and tel. no.]				
18	as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings				
19	related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.				
20	Dated:, 201 at (location):				
21	Name: Signature:				
22					
23					
24					
25					
26					
27					
28	1				